



---

Soviet-era science, translated into English

# Reports of the Academy of Sciences of the USSR

Yu. SMIRNOV

1958

SovietRxiv

---

View the original and related papers at <https://sovietrxiv.org/items/ru-195801.88848>

Source: Math-Net.Ru and CyberLeninka. Machine translation. Verify with the original.

**Abstract**

**Full Text**

## **Reports of the Academy of Sciences of the USSR**

1958. Volume 123, No. 1

**MATHEMATICS**

**Yu. SMIRNOV**

### **AN EXAMPLE OF A ZERO-DIMENSIONAL NORMAL SPACE HAVING INFINITE DI- MENSION IN THE SENSE OF COVERINGS**

*(Presented by Academician P. S. Aleksandrov on 9 VI 1958)*

Dowker <sup>(1)</sup> constructed a remarkable normal space  $M$  with dimensions\*  $\text{ind } M = 0$  and  $\text{dim } M = 1$ . It is topologically embedded in the zero-dimensional (in all senses) bicomactum  $D^\tau$ , thereby disproving P. S. Aleksandrov's hypothesis on the monotonicity of the dimension  $\text{dim}$  in the class of normal spaces.

The aim of this paper is the following generalization of Dowker's construction, leading to the example indicated in the title (see item H).

A. Let  $T$  be the space of all ordinal numbers  $\alpha$  not exceeding  $\omega_1$ , and  $W = T \setminus \omega_1$ . For each  $\alpha < \omega_1$  we shall call the set  $W_\alpha = \delta\{\beta : \beta > \alpha\}$  an  $\alpha$ -tail. Let  $P$  be an arbitrary metric space with a countable base.

We shall call a set  $M$  of the product  $W \times P$  *convergent* (to  $P$ ) if for every point  $p \in P$  there is a tail  $W_\alpha$  such that  $W_\alpha \times p \subseteq M$ .

**Theorem 1.** *Every convergent set  $M$  of the product  $W \times P$  is normal, countably paracompact\*\*, and  $\text{dim } M = \text{dim } P$ ; if, moreover,  $\text{ind } P = 0$ , then  $\text{dim } M = \text{dim } P$  also in the infinite-dimensional cases\*\*\*.*

To prove this, a series of auxiliary lemmas is needed.

B. *The intersection of a countable or finite number of closed cofinal  $\omega_1$ -sets  $A_i$  of the space  $W$  is nonempty\*\*\*\*.*

C. *If the sets  $\Gamma_i$  are open in  $W$  and  $W = \bigcup_i \Gamma_i$ ,  $i = 1, 2, \dots$ , then at least one of them contains some  $\alpha$ -tail  $W_\alpha$ .*

---

\* "Zero-dimensionality" is here to be understood only in the sense of the "small" inductive dimension  $\text{ind}$  (induction is carried out over points). We shall also

consider the “large” inductive dimension  $\text{Ind}$  (induction is carried out over closed sets) and, mainly, the dimension  $\text{dim}$ , defined by means of finite open covers.

\*\* A space  $R$  is countably paracompact and normal if into every countable or finite open cover  $\{\Gamma_i\}$  one can inscribe a closed cover  $\{\Phi_i\}$  such that  $\Phi_i \subseteq \Gamma_i$  <sup>(2)</sup>.

\*\*\* From the point of view of essential mappings there are three types of infinite-dimensional spaces. We shall write  $\text{dim } R < \mathfrak{n}$  (respectively,  $\text{dim } R < \mathfrak{N}$ ) if for every countable system  $\pi$  of pairs of closed sets  $A_i, B_i$ ,  $A_i \cap B_i = \emptyset$ , there exist closed sets  $C_i$  separating the space  $R$  between  $A_i$  and  $B_i$  and such that  $\bigcap C_i = \emptyset$  for all  $i$  (respectively, for  $i \leq N = N(\pi)$ ). For countably paracompact (respectively, normal) spaces the assertion  $\text{dim } R < \mathfrak{n}$  (respectively,  $\text{dim } R < \mathfrak{N}$ ) is equivalent to the following: for any sequence of continuous (real-valued) functions  $g_i$  and any number  $\varepsilon, \varepsilon > 0$ , one can find continuous functions  $f_i$  such that  $|g_i - f_i| < \varepsilon$  and  $\bigcap f_i^{-1}(0) = \emptyset$  (respectively, for  $i \leq N(\pi)$ ), where  $\emptyset$  is the empty set.

\*\*\*\* By virtue of cofinality there is a sequence  $\{\alpha_i\}$ ,  $\alpha_i < \omega_1$ , and a limit ordinal  $\alpha$  such that  $\alpha_{2^{n+i}} \in A_i$  for  $i = 0, \dots, 2^{n+1} - 1$ , and hence  $\alpha \in \bigcap_i A_i$ .

D. If the sets  $\Gamma_i$  are open in  $W \times P$  and  $M \subseteq \bigcup_i \Gamma_i$ ,  $i = 1, 2, \dots$ , then for any point  $p \in P$  there exist a neighborhood  $Op$ , a tail  $W_\beta$ , and a set  $\Gamma_i$  such that  $W_\beta \times Op \subseteq \Gamma_i$ .

Indeed, for the point  $p$  there is a tail  $W_\alpha$  such that  $W_\alpha \times p \subseteq M$ . By C there exist a number  $\beta \geq \alpha$  and a set  $\Gamma_i$  such that  $W_\beta \times p \subseteq \Gamma_i$ . For each  $\lambda, \lambda \geq \beta$ , take the real number  $\varepsilon_\lambda$ —the largest of all numbers  $\varepsilon > 0$  such that  $\lambda \times O_\varepsilon p \subseteq \Gamma_i$ . The number  $\delta = \inf_\lambda \varepsilon_\lambda$  is positive, since otherwise there would be order numbers  $\lambda_k$ , converging to a number  $\lambda < \omega_1$ , such that  $\varepsilon_{\lambda_k} \rightarrow 0$ , whence it would follow that  $(\lambda, p) \notin \Gamma_i$  and  $\lambda \geq \beta$ , contrary to the inclusion  $W_\beta \times p \subseteq \Gamma_i$ . Thus,  $\lambda \times O_\delta p \subseteq \Gamma_i$  for every  $\lambda \geq \beta$ , which was required to be proved.

E. If the sets  $\Gamma_i$  are open in  $W \times P$  and  $M \subseteq \bigcup_i \Gamma_i$ , where  $i = 1, 2, \dots$ , then there exist an order number  $\beta, \beta < \omega_1$ , and open sets  $U_i$  of the space  $P$  such that  $P = \bigcup_i U_i$  and  $W_\beta \times U_i \subseteq \Gamma_i$  for each  $i$ .

Indeed, by D, for any point  $p \in P$  there exist numbers  $\beta(p) < \omega_1$  and  $i(p) < \omega_0$  and a neighborhood  $Op$  such that  $W_{\beta(p)} \times Op \subseteq \Gamma_{i(p)}$ . Choose a countable number of sets  $Op_j$  covering the space  $P$ , with countable base. Let  $\beta = \sup \beta(p_j)$ , and let

$$U_i = \bigcup_{i(p_j)=i} Op_j$$

for each  $i$ . This is what is needed.

F. Every continuous function  $f$ , defined on  $M$ , is finally constant, i.e. there is a number  $\beta, \beta < \omega_1$ , such that if  $\beta \leq \gamma < \gamma' < \omega_1$  and  $(\gamma, p) \in M$ , then  $f(\gamma, p) = f(\gamma', p)$ .

Indeed, let  $p \in P$ . Then there is a number  $\beta_p < \omega_1$  such that, if  $\gamma \geq \beta_p$ , then  $(\gamma, p) \in M$  and  $f(\gamma, p) = f(\beta_p, p)$  (see <sup>(3)</sup>, p. 300). Take a countable dense set of points  $p_k$  from  $P$  and the number  $\beta = \sup \beta_k$ . Then, if  $\gamma \geq \beta$ , then  $(\gamma, p_k) \in M$  and  $f(\gamma, p_k) = f(\beta, p_k)$ . If  $p \neq p_k$ , but  $\beta \leq \gamma < \gamma' < \omega_1$  and  $(\gamma, p) \in M$ , then let  $p_{k_j} \rightarrow p$ . Then we have:  $f(\gamma', p) = \lim_j f(\gamma', p_{k_j}) = \lim_j f(\gamma, p_{k_j}) = f(\gamma, p)$ , which was required to be proved.

**Proof of the theorem.** We shall use the definition of dimension  $\dim$  by means of “partitions”\*. Let  $\dim P < m$ , where  $m \in \{0, 1, 2, \dots, \mathfrak{w}, \mathfrak{W}\}$ . We shall prove that  $\dim P < m$ . Let  $A_i, B_i, A_i \cap B_i = \emptyset, i = 1, 2, \dots$ , be closed subsets of  $M$ . There exist sets  $\Gamma_A^i, \Gamma_B^i$ , open in  $W \times P$ , such that

$$M \cap \Gamma_A^i = M \setminus A_i \quad \text{and} \quad M \cap \Gamma_B^i = M \setminus B_i.$$

Applying Lemma E to each pair  $\{\Gamma_A^i, \Gamma_B^i\}$  and taking a sufficiently large number  $\beta, \beta < \omega_1$ , we find that for the closed subsets  $A'_i = P \setminus U_A^i, B'_i = P \setminus U_B^i$  of  $P$  the relations

$$A_i \cap (W_\beta \times P) \subseteq W_\beta \times A'_i, \quad B_i \cap (W_\beta \times P) \subseteq W_\beta \times B'_i$$

hold, and  $A'_i \cap B'_i = \emptyset$ . There are closed sets  $C'_i$ , partitioning the space  $P$  between  $A'_i$  and  $B'_i$ , the required number of which have empty intersection. The sets  $W_\beta \times C'_i$  partition  $W_\beta \times P$  and, in the required number, have empty intersection. The product  $\mathcal{E}\{\alpha : \alpha \leq \beta\} \times P$  has a countable base and, hence,  $\dim(\mathcal{E}\{\alpha : \alpha \leq \beta\} \times P) < m^{**}$ . Hence, in the finite case, and under the condition  $\text{ind } P = 0$ , also in the infinite case, we obtain that

$$\dim(M \setminus (W_\beta \times P)) = \text{ind } P < m.$$

Since  $M \setminus (W_\beta \times P)$  is open and closed in  $M$ , there exist sets  $C''_i$ , closed in  $M$ , complementing  $M \setminus (W_\beta \times P)$ ,

---

\*  $\dim R < n$ , if for every system of  $(n + 1)$  pairs  $\{A_i, B_i\}$  of closed sets  $A_i, B_i, A_i \cap B_i = \emptyset$ , one can find closed sets  $C_i$ , partitioning the space  $R$  between  $A_i$  and  $B_i$ , such that  $\bigcap C_i = \emptyset$ . The equivalence of this definition with the usual one for normal spaces was proved by P. S. Aleksandrov.

\*\* This is also true in the infinite-dimensional case, but it obviously does not follow from this that  $\dim(M \cap (\mathcal{E}\{\alpha : \alpha \leq \beta\} \times P)) < m$ . For this it is sufficient to require, for  $\mathfrak{w}$ , that  $\text{ind } P < \omega_0$ , and, for  $\mathfrak{W}$ , that  $\text{ind } P < \omega_2$ .

separating it between  $A_i \cap M \setminus (W_\beta \times P)$  and  $B_i \cap M \setminus (W_\beta \times P)$  with empty intersection in the required number. Then the sets  $C'_i \cup (W_\beta \times C'_i)$  separate  $M$  between  $A_i$  and  $B_i$  and, in the required number, give an empty intersection, as was to be proved. Normality and countable paracompactness are proved analogously.

Conversely, let  $A'_i, B'_i, A'_i \cap B'_i = \emptyset$ , be closed sets in  $P$ . If  $\dim M < m$ , then there exist continuous functions  $f_i$ , defined on  $M$ , such that

$$f_i(M \cap (W \times A'_i)) = 1, \quad f_i(M \cap (W \times B'_i)) = -1 \quad \text{and} \quad \bigcap f_i^{-1}(0) = \emptyset$$

for the required number of functions. By virtue of F one may put  $f'_i(p) = f_i(\gamma_p, p)$ , where  $\gamma_p$  is sufficiently large, and prove the continuity of the functions  $f'_i$ . We have

$$f'_i(A'_i) = 1, \quad f'_i(B'_i) = -1 \quad \text{and} \quad \bigcap f_i^{-1}(0) = \emptyset$$

for the required number of functions  $f'_i$ , i.e.  $\dim P < m$ , as was to be proved.

**Theorem 2.** *For every metric space  $P$  with a countable base, in the product  $W \times P$  there exists a zero-dimensional (i.e.  $\text{ind } M = 0$ ) convergent set  $M$  (of the same dimension  $\dim$  as  $P$ ).*

G. *Every metric space with a countable base can be represented as the sum of zero-dimensional sets forming a nondecreasing transfinite sequence of type  $\omega_1$ .*  
\*

Indeed, for the interval  $E^1$  such a representation was obtained by Dowker (1).  
**Let**

$$E^1 = \bigcup_{\alpha} P_{\alpha}^1, \quad \alpha < \omega_1, \quad P_{\alpha}^1 \subset P_{\alpha'}^1 \quad \text{for} \quad \alpha < \alpha'.$$

**For the Hilbert cube  $E^{\infty} = (E^1)^{\aleph_0}$  an analogous representation**

$$E^{\infty} = \bigcup_{\alpha} P_{\alpha}^{\infty}$$

**is made up of powers** \* of the sets  $P_{\alpha}^1$ :

$$P_{\alpha}^{\infty} = (P_{\alpha}^1)^{\aleph_0}.$$

For an arbitrary space  $P$  with a countable base, the required representation

$$P = \bigcup_{\alpha} P_{\alpha}$$

is obtained by intersection: if  $P \subset E^{\infty}$ , then  $P \cap P_{\alpha}^{\infty} = P_{\alpha}$ .

**Proof of the theorem.** Let

$$P = \bigcup_{\alpha} P_{\alpha}$$

be the representation obtained in G. The set

$$M = \bigcup_{\alpha} (W_{\alpha} \times P_{\alpha})$$

is convergent and  $\text{ind } M = 0$ , as was to be proved.

H. The desired example is obtained by taking the representation of the Hilbert cube  $E^\infty$  constructed in G and the corresponding convergent set  $M$  of the product  $W \times E^\infty$ .

Moscow State University  
named after M. V. Lomonosov

Received  
6 V 1958

## REFERENCES

1. C. H. Dowker, *Canad. J. Math.*, **3**, 219 (1951).
2. C. H. Dowker, *Quart. J. Math.*, **6**, No. 22, 101 (1955).
3. Yu. Smirnov, *Matem. sborn.*, **38**, No. 3, 283 (1956).

\* Under the assumption of the continuum hypothesis this is obvious.

\*\* Let  $Q_0$  be the set of rational points of the interval  $E^1 = [0; 1]$ , and let  $Q_\alpha$  be the congruence classes modulo  $Q_\alpha$ , numbered by ordinal numbers  $\alpha$ ,  $0 \leq \alpha < \omega(c)$ . The sets

$$P_\alpha^1 = \bigcup_{\gamma \geq \omega_1} Q_\gamma \cup \bigcup_{\beta < \alpha} Q_\beta$$

are zero-dimensional for  $\alpha < \omega_1$ , and, moreover,

$$E^1 = \bigcup P_\alpha^1.$$

\*\*\* That is, the Tychonoff product of the spaces  $P_\alpha^1$  with themselves, taken the required number of times. This construction was suggested to me by S. Proizvolov. Obviously,  $\text{ind } P_\alpha^\infty = 0$ ; if  $\alpha < \alpha'$ , then  $P_\alpha^\infty \subset P_{\alpha'}^\infty$ ; if  $\{x_i\} \in E^\infty$ , then, taking numbers  $\alpha_i$  such that  $x_i \in P_{\alpha_i}^1$ , we find that  $\{x_i\} \in P_\alpha^\infty$  for  $\alpha = \sup \alpha_i$ .

*Note: Figure translations are in progress. See original paper for figures.*

*Source: Math-Net.Ru and CyberLeninka. Machine translation. Verify with the original.*