
AI translation · View original & related papers at
chinaxiv.org/items/chinaxiv-202301.00176

Research Status of the Application of TCM Nursing Quality Evaluation in TCM Nursing Management

Authors: Kong Hua, Xing Liang, Tian Jing, Gao Xinxia

Date: 2023-01-20T00:00:00+00:00

Abstract

This paper reviews the current research status of Traditional Chinese Medicine (TCM) nursing quality evaluation from the perspectives of evaluation models, evaluation indicators, and tools and methods, and proposes several considerations for the construction of a TCM nursing quality evaluation system, aiming to provide a basis for developing a nursing quality evaluation system with TCM characteristics.

Full Text

Current Research Status of Traditional Chinese Medicine Nursing Quality Evaluation in TCM Nursing Management

Kong Hua¹, Xing Liang¹, Tian Jing², Gao Xinxia³

¹ Department of Joint 4, Wangjing Hospital, China Academy of Chinese Medical Sciences, Beijing 100102

² Department of Orthopedics and Traumatology, Wangjing Hospital, China Academy of Chinese Medical Sciences, Beijing 100102

³ Department of Nursing, Wangjing Hospital, China Academy of Chinese Medical Sciences, Beijing 100102

Abstract

This paper reviews the current research status of Traditional Chinese Medicine (TCM) nursing quality evaluation from three perspectives: evaluation models, evaluation indicators, and evaluation tools/methods. It also proposes several considerations for constructing a TCM nursing quality evaluation system, aiming to provide a foundation for developing a nursing quality evaluation framework with TCM characteristics.

Keywords: TCM nursing; quality evaluation; evaluation indicators

Introduction

Driven by national policies, Traditional Chinese Medicine and appropriate TCM techniques have garnered widespread attention from all sectors of society. The *National Nursing Career Development Plan (2016-2020)* identifies the active development of TCM specialty nursing, innovation of TCM nursing models, and improvement of TCM nursing standards as key priorities [1]. TCM nursing is a comprehensive care system based on TCM theory, integrated with modern scientific technology and management concepts, centered on the TCM constitution, and employing TCM theories and techniques to alleviate disease-related symptoms and improve treatment outcomes [2]. As TCM nursing techniques become increasingly prevalent in clinical practice, the demand for quality management in TCM nursing has grown more stringent. Nursing quality evaluation serves as a crucial tool in nursing quality management, enabling effective monitoring of clinical nursing work and facilitating continuous quality improvement through repeated tracking, evaluation, and analysis [3]. Therefore, constructing a scientific, rational, and modern TCM nursing evaluation system with distinctive TCM characteristics is both essential and imperative for advancing the development of TCM nursing. This paper examines the current state of research on TCM nursing quality evaluation to provide an effective basis for constructing a more scientific and rigorous evaluation system.

1. Different Models of TCM Nursing Quality Evaluation

TCM nursing quality evaluation plays a vital role in TCM nursing management. Numerous scholars have diligently innovated evaluation models to ensure greater scientific rigor and promote continuous improvement in TCM nursing quality.

1.1 360-Degree Evaluation Method

Duan Xiaoyan et al. [4] developed a 360-degree evaluation approach based on the 360-degree assessment method and adapted to hospital development conditions. This model effectively mobilized nurses' enthusiasm for learning and work during the construction of high-quality nursing service demonstration wards, promoted the application of TCM techniques in nursing practice, and improved TCM nursing quality with favorable results. Shen Xia [5] applied 360-degree performance feedback indicators, collecting subjective evaluation information about head nurses from superiors, subordinates, peers, and patients across five dimensions, combined with objective indicators to determine weight coefficients for each indicator. By comparing annual performance scores, the study found that the 360-degree performance feedback method comprehensively reflects head nurses' overall performance and facilitates their professional development and accurate performance evaluation.

1.2 Hospital Trusteeship Model

Since 2019, Yuyao City Hospital of Traditional Chinese Medicine has been managed by Ningbo Hospital of Traditional Chinese Medicine. Through further integration of high-quality nursing resources and reference to tertiary Grade A TCM hospital nursing quality evaluation standards, the hospital re-established 13 nursing evaluation criteria and established a three-level quality control management system, constructing a nursing quality evaluation standard system and management model with characteristics of primary-level TCM hospitals. Under this trusteeship model, TCM nursing quality and service levels were significantly improved, with enhanced clinical application and promotion of TCM nursing techniques, laying a foundation for the development of primary-level TCM hospitals [6].

1.3 ISO9000 Quality Management Standard Model

Jiang Lin et al. [7] explored TCM clinical nursing quality evaluation compatible with the ISO9000 quality management standard model, employing process management concepts to identify, analyze, and solve problems in a timely manner, creating a virtuous cycle and establishing a scientifically rigorous TCM nursing teaching quality evaluation system that provides reliable basis for controlling TCM nursing teaching quality. Wang Qin et al. [8] constructed a TCM clinical nursing teaching quality evaluation system based on the ISO9000 standard model, comprising 4 first-level indicators, 12 second-level indicators, and 23 third-level indicators with TCM characteristics. Practice has demonstrated that this model's evaluation indicators can provide certain assistance for TCM clinical nursing teaching.

1.4 Three-Dimensional Quality Evaluation Theory

Since Avedis Donabedian proposed the three-dimensional quality evaluation theory in 1966, the "Structure-Process-Outcome" evaluation theory has continuously evolved, providing a reliable theoretical foundation for improving nursing quality. The three-dimensional quality structure model covers all stages of nursing care. By evaluating key factors in the structure, process, and outcome of care services, it identifies intervention strategies to improve care quality and enhance overall nursing standards. This model has been widely applied in constructing nursing quality evaluation systems both domestically and internationally [9-10].

2. TCM Nursing Quality Evaluation Indicators

The Joint Commission on Accreditation of Healthcare Organizations proposed that nursing quality evaluation indicators are nursing-specific quantitative metrics that enable objective assessment of nursing quality and serve as important tools for ensuring nursing standards [11]. Currently, China's TCM nursing evaluation indicators can be categorized based on evaluation objects into general indicators, specialty-specific indicators, and single-disease evaluation indicators.

2.1 General Indicators for TCM Nursing Quality Evaluation

Certain indicators can be universally applied across departments during TCM nursing quality evaluation, serving as comprehensive quality evaluation metrics. Wang Lixia et al. [12] analyzed existing problems in TCM nursing during the construction of a TCM nursing process quality evaluation system, summarized principles for constructing indicators at various levels, and proposed specific methods for improving the nursing quality management system, quality point control management, and implementation of the nursing quality evaluation system. This scientifically credible system can be applied across all TCM departments as a reference for TCM nursing quality control. In Li Yuhong et al.'s research [13], the observation group adopted TCM characteristic nursing quality evaluation with main indicators including safety management, characteristic nursing, health education, ward management, operation proficiency, basic nursing, service attitude, and nursing documentation. Through comparative analysis, all indicator scores in the observation group were superior to the control group, demonstrating that TCM characteristic nursing quality evaluation management can improve nursing quality and effectiveness, enhance patient compliance, and promote harmonious nurse-patient relationships. Ma Wenyun et al. [14] developed an on-site inspection and evaluation form comprising 9 indicators during TCM characteristic nursing quality evaluation: TCM nursing operations, medication familiarity, use of TCM diagnostic and treatment equipment, disease condition mastery, nursing documentation, environmental management, TCM manipulation techniques, health education, and nursing self-inspection. This standardized clinical nursing techniques, improved comprehensive nursing capabilities, and enhanced overall TCM nursing quality.

2.2 Specialty-Specific Indicators for TCM Nursing Quality Evaluation

Specialty-specific indicators for TCM nursing quality evaluation assess nursing quality in particular specialty areas with discipline-specific characteristics. Lu Mingjun [15] applied a TCM characteristic nursing quality evaluation system in TCM gynecology management, primarily including 4 first-level objectives and 18 second-level objectives. The construction of this system significantly improved both gynecological patient satisfaction and departmental TCM nursing quality. Zhang Jia et al. [16] constructed a comprehensive ophthalmology nursing quality evaluation system from the patient perspective based on the three-dimensional quality evaluation system, employing the analytic hierarchy process and multi-level fuzzy comprehensive evaluation method to establish 1 evaluation objective, 3 evaluation contents, 14 evaluation elements, and 67 evaluation indicators. Through specific case studies, they validated the system's rationality and feasibility, though the evaluation indicators lacked distinctive TCM nursing characteristics. Kong Feiyan [17] constructed an ICU TCM characteristic nursing quality evaluation system based on actual ICU positions and working conditions. Through document review, face-to-face communication, and questioning, the system evaluated nurses' mastery of TCM nursing knowledge, frequency

and qualification rate of TCM nursing technique operations, implementation of TCM characteristic health education, and development of TCM nursing education guidelines for dominant diseases. It assessed whether nurses could provide appropriate emotional and dietary regulation according to patients' TCM syndrome types and scientific medication guidance, comprehensively considering ICU TCM nursing staff's professional level and individual competence, thereby significantly improving overall ICU TCM nursing standards.

2.3 Single-Disease Indicators for TCM Nursing Quality Evaluation

With the development of high-quality nursing, research on TCM nursing quality evaluation has continuously deepened, with many scholars developing more refined single-disease TCM nursing evaluations. Zhang Lili et al. [18] provided TCM syndrome differentiation nursing for patients with decompensated liver cirrhosis, including emotional nursing, TCM dietary therapy, and TCM compress and acupuncture therapy, using the SF-36 quality of life scale to assess patient quality of life. Results preliminarily confirmed that TCM nursing combined with conventional care significantly improved quality of life and hospitalization experience for patients with decompensated liver cirrhosis. The limitation of this study was the lack of a standardized TCM nursing evaluation system. Wang Xiao [19] constructed a herpes zoster TCM nursing quality evaluation system using the "Structure-Process-Outcome" theory as the basic model framework, consulting extensive literature and expert interviews, and employing the Delphi method and analytic hierarchy process to calculate indicator weights and predict internal consistency and structural stability. The resulting system comprised 3 first-level indicators, 9 second-level indicators, and 35 third-level indicators, demonstrating good internal consistency and structural stability through pilot surveys. This evaluation system possesses strong applicability and scientific rigor, providing a scientific basis for single-disease TCM nursing evaluation and management in dermatology. Bai Jingshuang et al. [20] constructed a continuous volume load assessment nursing quality evaluation indicator system for heart failure patients using the "Structure-Process-Outcome" theoretical framework. Through literature review, semi-structured interviews, and research group discussions, they developed a draft indicator system, which was finalized using the expert consultation method into a system comprising 3 first-level indicators, 10 second-level indicators, and 41 third-level indicators. This nursing quality evaluation indicator system is scientific and systematic, holding significant importance for improving heart failure volume management nursing quality.

3. Tools and Methods for TCM Nursing Quality Evaluation

3.1 Evaluation Tools

In constructing TCM characteristic nursing quality evaluations, clinical managers consider multiple evidence-based factors to identify evaluation tools that align with their hospital's actual conditions, ensuring the constructed evaluation system can drive continuous improvement in TCM nursing quality. Wang

Bowen [21] used the *Hebei Province Secondary and Tertiary Hospital High-Quality Nursing Service Evaluation Details* as a tool to investigate and analyze the implementation of high-quality nursing services in geriatric departments across 43 hospitals in 12 regions of Hebei Province. The study identified issues in geriatric nursing specialty training, related systems, psychological and health guidance, and internet-plus nursing services, recommending that hospitals strengthen geriatric specialty development and vigorously promote continuous care through internet-plus nursing services. Liu Mei et al. [22] used the *Guidelines for Nursing Work in TCM Hospitals* as a standard to develop specific quality evaluation indicators based on their hospital's actual conditions. These indicators primarily covered the implementation of nursing elements, process quality, and terminal quality. The hospital regularly organized discussions on scoring standards for TCM characteristic nursing quality evaluation and continuously improved and optimized them, effectively enhancing geriatric department TCM nursing management outcomes and overall departmental nursing technical levels, enabling the provision of more satisfactory and high-quality nursing services to patients and achieving the goal of improving clinical healthcare benefits.

3.2 Evaluation Methods

Wang Lin [23] established a TCM characteristic nursing quality evaluation method based on nursing quality evaluation standards in the *Guidelines for TCM Nursing Work in TCM Hospitals*. Evaluation items included TCM nursing quality, TCM nursing technique operation proficiency, TCM theoretical knowledge assessment, and patient satisfaction. A nursing expert evaluation team was also established to improve nursing work quality and efficiency through expert supervision, assessment, and interviews, providing timely feedback on deficiencies in nursing processes and accurate evaluation to ensure smooth implementation of nursing work. Wang Yang [24] implemented a TCM nursing management quality evaluation system by establishing a dedicated gynecology nursing quality evaluation group composed of nurses and physicians with extensive work experience and strong professional competence. After training group members to ensure implementation of the evaluation system content, the approach emphasized many nursing work details, facilitated quality control, reduced work errors, and improved implementation effectiveness. Chen Xingqiong [25] developed a comprehensive TCM nursing quality evaluation standard in TCM nursing management through three approaches: head nurse-nurse interviews, patient interviews, and quality evaluation special group interviews. A special group was established to conduct on-site reviews for internal nursing inspections, resulting in varying degrees of improvement and enhancement in both TCM management and service levels.

4. Considerations for Constructing TCM Nursing Quality Evaluation Systems

4.1 The Imperative to Establish TCM-Characteristic Evaluation Models

Currently, international research focuses primarily on Western medicine nursing standards, while TCM nursing started relatively late. Most TCM nursing evaluation models are based on Donabedian's "Structure-Process-Outcome" framework. Although scholars have developed innovative perspectives on TCM nursing quality evaluation content, these lack uniformity. Therefore, constructing a scientifically rational and unified TCM characteristic quality evaluation system is imperative.

4.2 Balancing Indicator Refinement with Practical Feasibility

As TCM nursing quality evaluation has gained attention from management at all hospital levels, research has increasingly moved toward more refined and in-depth specialty- and disease-specific domains. Many scholars have attempted to distinguish their work by increasing the hierarchical levels of evaluation structures and observation indicators, with some systems containing over a hundred indicators. However, excessive indicators increase nursing assessment workload and reduce implementability. Future TCM nursing quality evaluation system construction should simplify certain indicators while enhancing the connotation of TCM nursing to truly promote sustainable TCM nursing development.

4.3 Ensuring Objectivity Through Multi-Institutional Collaboration

During the construction of TCM nursing quality evaluation systems, many scholars have mentioned establishing expert teams to ensure smooth implementation. However, most hospitals form evaluation groups with internal staff when establishing nursing quality evaluation teams, which may compromise objectivity in clinical supervision. To ensure objectivity in TCM nursing quality evaluation, non-hospital expert team cross-evaluation should be adopted to guarantee the objectivity and scientific rigor of the evaluation system construction and demonstrate the application value of nursing quality evaluation, thereby genuinely improving TCM nursing quality.

References

- [1] National Health and Family Planning Commission. *National Nursing Career Development Plan (2016-2020)* [S]. 2016.
- [2] Yu Hongjing, Liu Xuemei, Gu Yuqin, et al. Construction of a TCM nursing quality indicator system for cardiovascular disease patients based on the Delphi method [J]. *Journal of Nurses Training*, 2022, 37(18): 1646-1650. DOI:10.16821/j.cnki.hsxx.2022.18.003.
- [3] Wang Huan, Yu Jiaohua, Feng Run, et al. Research progress on clinical nurs-

- ing quality evaluation [J]. *Chinese Nursing Research*, 2014, 28(04): 390-392.
- [4] Duan Xiaoyan, Han Lin, Li Na. Application of 360-degree evaluation method in TCM nursing quality intervention [J]. *Chinese Nursing Research*, 2013, 27(17): 1771-1773.
- [5] Shen Xia, Cui Yan, Cao Lihua. Application evaluation of 360-degree performance feedback method in head nurse performance appraisal [J]. *Evidence-Based Nursing*, 2018, 4(01): 72-74.
- [6] Yan Yan, Zhang Yingchun, Wei Zhen. Construction of nursing quality evaluation standards and management model for primary-level TCM hospitals under trusteeship model [J]. *Journal of Traditional Chinese Medicine Management*, 2021, 29(15): 160-162. DOI:10.16690/j.cnki.1007-9203.2021.15.080.
- [7] Jiang Lin, Zhang Yali, Wang Xiaodong, et al. Construction of clinical nursing teaching quality evaluation index system in TCM hospitals based on ISO9000 standards [J]. *Journal of Nursing Management*, 2015, 15(09): 626-628.
- [8] Wang Qin, Wang Xiuyue, Wang Ying. Construction of clinical nursing teaching quality evaluation index system in TCM hospitals based on ISO9000 standards [J]. *Journal of Traditional Chinese Medicine Management*, 2021, 29(23): 363-364. DOI:10.16690/j.cnki.1007-9203.2021.23.207.
- [9] Xu Li, Li Dandan, Xu Fengqin. Application of "Structure-Process-Outcome" theory in nursing quality evaluation system construction [J]. *Health Vocational Education*, 2019, 37(12): 128-130.
- [10] Sawyer Linda M, Berkowitz Bobbie, Haber Judith E, et al. Expanding American Nurses Association nursing quality indicators to community-based practices [J]. *Outcomes Management*, 2002, 6(2).
- [11] JCAHO. Characteristics of clinical indicators [J]. *Quality Review Bulletin*, 1989, 15(11): 330-339.
- [12] Wang Lixia, Cheng Jingjing, Ye Yuzhu. Construction of TCM nursing process quality evaluation system [J]. *Journal of Traditional Chinese Medicine Management*, 2019, 27(24): 65-66. DOI:10.16690/j.cnki.1007-9203.2019.24.032.
- [13] Li Yuhong, Dong Guifang, Zhang Liane, et al. Application value of TCM characteristic nursing quality evaluation in TCM nursing management and its impact on patient satisfaction [J]. *China Health Industry*, 2021, 18(27): 5-8. DOI:10.16659/j.cnki.1672-5654.2021.27.005.
- [14] Ma Wenyun, Liu Chunmei, Fan Wenyun. Application of TCM characteristic nursing quality evaluation in TCM nursing management [J]. *Journal of Traditional Chinese Medicine Management*, 2019, 27(4): 186-187.
- [15] Lu Mingjun. Application of TCM characteristic nursing quality evaluation system in TCM gynecology management [J]. *Maternal and Child World*, 2020(5): 195.
- [16] Zhang Jia, Jia Xinxin, Zhu Dongmei. Research on patient-centered comprehensive ophthalmology nursing quality evaluation system [J]. *Evidence-Based Nursing*, 2022, 8(7): 897-901. DOI:10.12102/j.issn.2095-8668.2022.07.007.
- [17] Kong Feiyan. Impact of TCM characteristic nursing quality evaluation on improving ICU TCM nursing effectiveness [J]. *Journal of Traditional Chinese Medicine Management*, 2022, 30(01): 123-124. DOI:10.16690/j.cnki.1007-9203.2022.01.074.

- [18] Zhang Lili. TCM nursing experience in improving quality of life for patients with decompensated liver cirrhosis [J]. *Cardiovascular Disease Electronic Journal of Integrated Traditional Chinese and Western Medicine*, 2017, 5(29): 139, 142. DOI:10.3969/j.issn.2095-6681.2017.29.113.
- [19] Wang Xiao. Construction of herpes zoster TCM nursing quality evaluation system using “Structure-Process-Outcome” theory [J]. *Journal of Nursing*, 2020, 27(1): 12-15. DOI:10.16460/j.issn1008-9969.2020.01.012.
- [20] Bai Jingshuang, Cai Libo, Han Bing, et al. Construction of nursing quality evaluation indicator system for continuous volume load assessment in heart failure patients [J]. *Chinese Nursing Research*, 2022, 36(19): 3398-3404.
- [21] Wang Bowen, Zhou Ce, Li Wei, et al. Analysis of evaluation results and improvement strategies for high-quality nursing in geriatric departments of 43 hospitals in Hebei Province [J]. *Nursing Practice and Research*, 2022, 19(10): 1457-1460.
- [22] Liu Mei, Gou Huijun, Zhang Hongmei, et al. Application of TCM characteristic nursing quality evaluation in TCM nursing management [J]. *World Latest Medicine Information*, 2018, 18(36): 15-16. DOI:10.19613/j.cnki.1671-3141.2018.36.008.
- [23] Wang Lin. Application of TCM characteristic nursing quality evaluation in TCM nursing management [J]. *Journal of Practical Traditional Chinese Medicine*, 2020, 36(7): 960.
- [24] Wang Yang. Application effect of quality evaluation in gynecological TCM nursing management [J]. *Family Pregnancy*, 2021, 3(4): 51.
- [25] Chen Xingqiong. Application effect of nursing quality evaluation in TCM nursing management [J]. *Contemporary Nurse*, 2020, 27(7): 186-187. DOI:10.19792/j.cnki.1006-6411.2020.20.077.

Corresponding Author: Gao Xinxia, E-mail: 13691111578@sina.com

Author Contributions:

Kong Hua: Conceived the research idea and literature search direction
Xing Liang: Conducted literature search
Tian Jing: Organized some literature
Kong Hua: Revised the final manuscript

This work was supported by the “Chinese Academy of Chinese Medical Sciences Science and Technology Innovation Project” (Project No.: CI 2021A03217).

Note: Figure translations are in progress. See original paper for figures.

Source: ChinaXiv –Machine translation. Verify with original.