

Postprint: Variation in Seed and Seedling Traits of *Dalbergia odorifera* from Different Provenances

Authors: Ge Yuzhen, Liang Huiling, Jiang Guoxiu, Yujing Wei, Huang Shixun

Date: 2019-08-26T00:00:00+00:00

Abstract

To explore variation patterns of phenotypic traits in seeds and seedlings of *Dalbergia odorifera* from different provenances and their relationships with geo-climatic factors, seeds from 10 provenances across Hainan, Fujian, Guangxi, and Guangdong provinces, together with seedlings cultivated in Guilin, Guangxi, served as experimental materials. Nine phenotypic traits of seeds and seedling growth were comparatively analyzed using variance analysis, correlation analysis, and principal component analysis. The results indicated considerable variation in phenotypic traits of *D. odorifera* seeds and seedlings, with highly significant differences among all nine traits. The mean coefficient of variation (CV) was 12.50%, ranging from 7.94% to 18.89%. Variation in seedling growth traits surpassed that in seed traits, indicating higher stability of seed traits. Correlation analysis revealed varying correlations among phenotypic traits and between these traits and geo-climatic factors. No significant correlations were found between phenotypic traits and longitude, latitude, or annual precipitation, whereas altitude, mean annual temperature, and annual rainfall were the primary factors influencing *D. odorifera* seed and seedling traits. Using the principal component comprehensive scoring method, three superior provenances were selected based on seed morphology, seedling growth, and germination performance, ranked by comprehensive scores as Xianyou, Danzhou, and Jianfengling provenances. These findings provide a scientific basis for selecting superior germplasm resources of *D. odorifera*.

Full Text

Preamble

DOI: [10.11931/guihaia.gxzw201905013](https://doi.org/10.11931/guihaia.gxzw201905013)

Geographic Variation of Seed and Seedling Traits of *Dalbergia odorifera* from Different Provenances

GE Yuzhen¹, LIANG Huiling¹, JIANG Guoxiu², WEI Yujing¹, HUANG Shixun^{1*}

¹ Guangxi Institute of Botany, Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region and Chinese Academy of Sciences, Guilin 541006, Guangxi, China

² Guilin Institute of Forestry Science, Guilin 541002, Guangxi, China

Abstract: To investigate the variation patterns of phenotypic traits of seeds and seedlings of *Dalbergia odorifera* from different provenances and their relationships with geographic-climatic factors, we conducted a comparative study on nine phenotypic traits of seeds and seedlings from ten provenances across Hainan, Fujian, Guangxi, and Guangdong provinces. Seeds were collected from these locations, and seedlings were cultivated in Guilin, Guangxi. Variance analysis, correlation analysis, and principal component analysis were employed. The results revealed considerable variation in phenotypic traits of *D. odorifera* seeds and seedlings, with highly significant differences observed among all nine traits. The average coefficient of variation (CV) was 12.50%, ranging from 7.94% to 18.89%. Seedling growth traits exhibited greater variation than seed traits, indicating higher stability in seed traits. Correlation analysis demonstrated varying relationships among phenotypic traits and between these traits and geographic-climatic factors. No significant correlations were found between phenotypic traits and longitude, latitude, or annual precipitation. However, altitude, annual mean temperature, and annual rainfall emerged as the primary factors influencing seed and seedling traits. Using the principal component comprehensive scoring method, we identified three superior families with excellent performance in seed morphology, seedling growth, and germination, ranked in order as Xianyou, Danzhou, and Jianfengling provenances. These findings provide a scientific basis for screening superior germplasm resources of *D. odorifera*.

Keywords: *Dalbergia odorifera*, seed, seedling traits, geographic-climatic factors, correlation

CLC Number: Q944.3

Document Code: A

Introduction

Dalbergia odorifera T. Chen is an evergreen semi-deciduous tree belonging to the Fabaceae family (Papilionoideae) and *Dalbergia* genus. It is native to regions in Hainan Province including Dongfang, Ledong, Changjiang, and Sanya, and was subsequently introduced to Guangdong, Guangxi, and southern Fujian from the late 1960s onward (Ni et al., 2008; Yao et al., 2013). The wood of *D. odorifera* is dense and beautifully grained, making it a premium material for high-end furniture. The dried heartwood from its trunk and roots has medicinal

properties, including blood pressure reduction, qi and blood circulation promotion, and pain and bleeding cessation. Due to its prominent economic value, wild resources of *D. odorifera* have suffered devastating destruction, pushing the species to the brink of extinction and earning it classification as a nationally protected second-class wild plant (Yang et al., 2007). Therefore, protecting existing wild resources and vigorously developing artificial cultivation of *D. odorifera* holds significant ecological and economic importance. In recent years, with the vigorous promotion of precious tree species in southern China, the planting area of *D. odorifera* has increased annually. Most artificial afforestation relies on seed propagation without improved variety selection, resulting in uneven seedling quality and severe growth differentiation. Consequently, there is an urgent need to select superior families to enhance cultivation benefits.

Current research on *D. odorifera* primarily focuses on introduction and cultivation (Guo & Jia, 2006; Chen et al., 2015; Wei & Chen, 2017), seed propagation (Yu et al., 2010; Yang et al., 2012; Liu et al., 2017), stress resistance (Jia et al., 2013; Yang et al., 2014), and pests and diseases (Chen et al., 2017; Xiang & Cui, 2018). In recent years, studies on superior provenance (family) selection have included: Chen (2015) conducted comprehensive analysis of growth indices in a 6-year-old experimental forest, preliminarily screening ten superior families suitable for coastal areas of southern Fujian; Ma et al. (2017) and Liang et al. (2019) evaluated seedling growth of different families; and Zhang et al. (2018) conducted cold resistance tests on seedlings from different provenances, providing experimental evidence for cold-tolerant germplasm breeding. Nevertheless, research on superior provenances (families) of *D. odorifera* remains relatively weak, with narrow geographic coverage in seed collection areas. This study selected *D. odorifera* from ten provenances across Hainan, Fujian, Guangdong, and Guangxi to investigate variation characteristics in seed quality and seedling growth among different provenances, aiming to provide a scientific basis for screening superior germplasm resources.

1. Materials and Methods

1.1 Experimental Materials

The experimental materials consisted of *D. odorifera* seeds from ten provenances across four provinces: Jianfengling (JFL) and Danzhou (DZ) in Hainan; Punning (PN) and Zhaoqing (ZQ) in Guangdong; Xianyou (XY), Fuzhou (FZ), and Xiamen (XM) in Fujian; and Guilin (GL), Nanning (NN), and Pingxiang (PX) in Guangxi. The natural conditions of each provenance are detailed in Table 1. Seeds were collected during the maturity period from December 2015 to January 2016. Seed-bearing trees were 10–15 years old, with seeds collected from more than 15 superior mother trees per provenance in equal quantities and mixed to form the test material for each provenance. The seedling nursery experiment was conducted at the Guangxi Institute of Botany Nursery in Yanshan Town, Guilin City (110°30' 58.29" E, 25°07' 78.65" N). Sowing trials and management were carried out in March 2016 using a randomized block design

with three replications.

1.2 Trait Measurements

1.2.1 Seed Morphological Traits Collected pods of *D. odorifera* were air-dried naturally, rubbed to remove edges. Thirty seeds from each provenance were randomly selected to measure seed length, width, and thickness using electronic calipers, with three replications. One hundred seeds per provenance were randomly weighed using an electronic balance, repeated eight times, to calculate thousand-grain weight. Seed germination rate was determined according to the “Forest Tree Seed Testing Procedures” (GB2772–1999).

1.2.2 Seedling Growth Traits In June 2017, growth data were collected from seedlings of the ten provenances. Plant height and ground diameter were measured for 30 randomly selected seedlings per provenance. Three seedlings with ground diameter close to the mean value were selected to measure above-ground and underground biomass.

1.3 Data Processing and Statistical Analysis

Data were processed using Excel 2010. SPSS 24.0 software was used for variance analysis and Duncan’s multiple comparisons. Correlation analysis was performed between seed and seedling traits and geographic-climatic factors of each provenance. Principal component analysis (PCA) was conducted on all traits (extracting principal components with eigenvalues > 1).

2. Results and Analysis

2.1 Comparison of Seed and Seedling Traits Among Different Provenances

Measurements of nine phenotypic traits—seed length, seed width, seed thickness, thousand-grain weight, germination rate, plant height, ground diameter, underground biomass, and aboveground biomass—are presented in Table 2. The results showed highly significant differences among all seed and seedling traits of *D. odorifera*, indicating substantial variation and rich diversity among provenances. Thousand-grain weight was highest for Jianfengling (80.7 g), 1.34 times that of Guilin (60.52 g). For seed morphological traits (length, width, thickness), seeds from Jianfengling, Danzhou, and Pingxiang were larger, while those from Zhaoqing, Puning, and Guilin were significantly smaller than other provenances. The highest germination rate was observed in Xiamen seeds (91.66%), while Pingxiang showed the lowest (67.22%). Plant height and ground diameter were greatest in Zhaoqing (122.7 cm and 9.85 cm, respectively), 16.3% and 26.4% higher than the mean values. The smallest plant height (90.2 cm) and ground diameter (6.97 cm) were from Fuzhou. Underground and aboveground biomass were highest in Xianyou (8.68 g and 58.2 g, respectively), 1.32 and 1.40 times the minimum values (from Guilin).

The coefficient of variation (CV) allows comparison of variation degrees among different phenotypic traits—higher CV indicates greater trait dispersion. CVs for the nine seed and seedling traits across ten provenances are shown in Table 3 . Average CVs among provenances ranged from 6.43% to 11.24%, with Xianyou showing the highest (11.24%), followed by Jianfengling > Guilin > Zhaoqing > Puning > Fuzhou > Danzhou > Pingxiang > Xiamen > Nanning. For the nine traits, average CVs ranged from 7.94% to 18.89%, with plant height showing the greatest variation (18.89%), indicating more pronounced differences among provenances, while seed length showed the smallest CV (7.94%), suggesting relatively minor differences among provenances.

2.2 Correlation Analysis Among Traits and with Geographic-Climatic Factors

Correlation analysis among the nine phenotypic traits and between traits and geographic-climatic factors is presented in Table 4 . Seed length showed significant positive correlation with thousand-grain weight ($r = 0.713$), indicating that longer seeds have greater mass. Seed thickness showed significant negative correlation with seed width ($r = -0.659$) and significant positive correlation with plant height ($r = 0.743$). Plant height was extremely significantly positively correlated with ground diameter ($r = 0.837$) and significantly positively correlated with aboveground biomass ($r = 0.755$), suggesting that biomass accumulation is strongly influenced by plant height—taller plants have correspondingly higher biomass levels—while ground diameter showed no significant correlation with other traits. Underground biomass was extremely significantly positively correlated with aboveground biomass ($r = 0.810$). Germination rate showed no significant correlation with any other trait.

Correlations between seed/seedling traits and geographic-climatic factors revealed that among seed traits, seed width was significantly negatively correlated with annual rainfall ($r = -0.661$), while thousand-grain weight was significantly positively correlated with annual mean temperature ($r = 0.722$), indicating that provenances with higher annual temperatures produce seeds with greater thousand-grain weight. Among seedling traits, altitude was significantly positively correlated with underground biomass ($r = 0.714$). No significant correlations were found between any traits and longitude or latitude.

2.3 Principal Component Analysis and Comprehensive Evaluation

2.3.1 Principal Component Analysis of Phenotypic Traits

To determine the influence of each trait on phenotypic variation, PCA was performed on nine traits. The results (Table 5) showed that the first three principal components had eigenvalues > 1, with a cumulative contribution rate of 83.507%, essentially reflecting most information from the original indicators. These three components could represent the original nine traits for analysis and evaluation. The first principal component (eigenvalue = 3.873, contribution rate = 43.036%) was represented by plant height, ground diameter, underground biomass, and

aboveground biomass, representing a comprehensive seedling growth trait. The second principal component (eigenvalue = 2.121, contribution rate = 23.569%) was represented by seed length, seed width, and thousand-grain weight, representing comprehensive seed morphology and quality traits. The third principal component (eigenvalue = 1.521, contribution rate = 16.901%) had high loading for germination rate, representing germination characteristics.

2.3.2 Comprehensive Evaluation of Different Provenances The three principal components comprehensively reflected the nine traits of *D. odorifera* seeds and seedlings. After standardizing the original data of major traits, component scores were calculated. Using the proportion of each component's eigenvalue to the sum of the three eigenvalues as weights, the comprehensive evaluation formula was: $F = 0.515F_1 + 0.282F_2 + 0.202F_3$. Comprehensive scores for different provenances were calculated and ranked to evaluate seed and seedling trait quality. Table 6 shows the ranking from highest to lowest: Xianyou > Danzhou > Jianfengling > Zhaoqing > Pingxiang > Nanning > Puning > Fuzhou > Xiamen > Guilin. Fujian's Xianyou provenance had the highest comprehensive score, while Guangxi's Guilin had the lowest.

3. Discussion

3.1 Analysis of Variation Characteristics in Seed and Seedling Traits

Plant trait characteristics are jointly influenced by genetic diversity and ecological environment, representing adaptive expressions to survival conditions (Liu et al., 2012). In this study, substantial phenotypic variation was observed among the ten provenances of *D. odorifera*, with highly significant differences among all nine traits, likely representing adaptive strategies to different environments. This pattern is similar to variation observed in *Lycoris radiata* (Yang et al., 2010) and *Tripterygium wilfordii* (Long et al., 2016). Based on CV values, the nine seed and seedling traits of *D. odorifera* ranged from 7.94% to 18.89%, indicating considerable genetic variation and substantial potential for genetic selection. Traits ranked by mean CV from high to low were: plant height, ground diameter, aboveground biomass, seed thickness, underground biomass, thousand-grain weight, germination rate, seed width, and seed length. Plant height and ground diameter showed the highest average within-population CVs (18.89% and 18.67%, respectively), while seed width and seed length showed the lowest (9.16% and 7.94%, respectively). CV values reflect variation amplitude—higher values indicate greater dispersion, while lower values indicate greater stability. Thus, seed length and width are relatively stable phenotypic traits, while plant height and ground diameter show greater variation within provenances, likely being more strongly influenced by environmental factors.

3.2 Correlation Between Traits and Geographic-Climatic Factors

Geographic and climatic factors are closely linked to plant growth and development, affecting both seed development and forest growth, with different tree species exhibiting distinct variation patterns. Seed and seedling trait variation in *Xanthoceras sorbifolium* is primarily influenced by altitude and annual sunshine hours (Yu et al., 2019). Liu et al. (2017) reported that altitude is the main environmental factor affecting seeds and fruits of *Keteleeria fortunei* var. *cyclolepis*. Lin et al. (2016) found that seed size in *Zenia insignis* shows latitudinal variation, with annual temperature and rainfall being the main climatic factors affecting seed size. Phenotypic traits of seeds and seedlings of *Syringa reticulata* subsp. *amurensis* correlate with frost-free period, annual mean temperature, and altitude (Yang et al., 2016). Our correlation analysis revealed that seed width was significantly negatively correlated with annual rainfall, thousand-grain weight was significantly positively correlated with annual mean temperature, and altitude was significantly positively correlated with underground biomass. These results indicate that altitude, annual mean temperature, and annual rainfall are the main factors affecting *D. odorifera* seed and seedling traits. Yao et al. (2013) identified annual mean temperature, annual sunshine hours, and altitude as the dominant climatic factors affecting *D. odorifera* introduction and cultivation in Fujian, consistent with our findings. Therefore, annual mean temperature and altitude should be prioritized as environmental factors in superior provenance selection and introduction programs.

3.3 Comprehensive Evaluation of Seed and Seedling Traits

Principal component analysis simplifies multiple evaluation indices into fewer independent comprehensive indicators, enabling more scientific, objective, and accurate evaluation by reflecting original variable information with minimal variables (Lin & Du, 2013). Mo et al. (2007) used PCA to analyze 11 seed traits in *Ginkgo biloba*, identifying key trait indicators for each variety. Chen et al. (2018) comprehensively compared 13 morphological and physiological indices of *Machilus pauhoi* seedlings from eight provenances using PCA to select superior provenances for various functions. Du et al. (2018) evaluated nine major traits of walnut nuts through PCA to screen ten superior individual plants. Thus, PCA has become an important method for solving practical forestry production problems. This study established a comprehensive quality evaluation system including nine seed and seedling traits to provide theoretical basis for selecting superior *D. odorifera* families. Using the principal component comprehensive scoring method, we identified three superior families with excellent performance in seed morphology, seedling growth, and germination, ranked as Xianyou, Danzhou, and Jianfengling provenances. However, this selection was based solely on seed and seedling traits without corresponding wood property analysis, and seedling traits were only evaluated at the juvenile stage, representing early performance. Therefore, combined selection for growth traits and wood properties would facilitate more comprehensive screening and utilization

of *D. odorifera* germplasm resources. Additionally, due to the complexity of tree growth, mid- and late-stage tracking studies are recommended to identify more stable superior families.

References

- CHEN JJ, ZHONG QL, CHEN DL, et al., 2018. Comparison of traits and the quality comprehensive evaluation of *Machilus pauhoi* provenances at the seedling stage [J]. *J Anhui Agric Univ*, 45(4): 638-644.
- CHEN SL, LIANG YN, ZHOU Y, et al., 2015. Study on introducing and cultivating technology of *Dalbergia odorifera* in west Guangdong [J]. *Guangdong For Sci Technol*, 31(6): 101-104.
- CHEN SL, LIANG YN, ZHOU Y, et al., 2016. Study on the relationship between heartwood and tree age of *Dalbergia odorifera* [J]. *S China Agric*, 10(4): 43-45.
- CHEN YQ, 2015. Research on introduction experiment of *Dalbergia odorifera* T. Chen superior families selection [J]. *J Fujian For Sci Technol*, 42(2): 84-89.
- CHEN Y, LI DQ, ZHOU GY, et al., 2017. Isolation, screening and identification of endophytic bacteria antagonistic to *Dalbergia odorifera* anthracnose [J]. *Trop For*, 45(1): 38-40.
- DU TY, HU QF, WANG XY, et al., 2018. The studies on walnut principal component analysis and superior variety selection [J]. *J Inner Mongolia Agric Univ (Nat Sci Ed)*, 39(2): 34-45.
- GUO WF, JIA HY, 2006. The introduction of *Dalbergia odorifera* in southern subtropical area of Guangxi [J]. *J Fujian For Sci Technol*, 33(4): 152-155.
- HUANG YP, 2013. Research on native flora in Fuzhou botanical garden [J]. *J Fujian For Sci Technol*, 40(3): 14-17.
- JIA RF, XU TP, YANG ZJ, et al., 2013. Photosynthesis physiological characteristics of *Dalbergia odorifera* seedlings under drought stress [J]. *Acta Bot Boreal-Occident Sin*, 33(6): 1197-1202.
- LI J, LAN GY, LI YW, et al., 2016. Comparison on soil micro flora in rubber forest and tropical secondary forest in Danzhou, Hainan island [J]. *Chi J Trop Crop*, 37(3): 433-438.
- LIANG YN, CHEN SL, ZHANG LJ, et al., 2019. Early growth evaluation of 10 *Dalbergia odorifera* families in Zhaoqing [J]. *For Environ Sci*, 35(2): 106-110.
- LIN HM, DU ZF, 2013. Some problems in comprehensive evaluation in the principal component analysis [J]. *Statistical Res*, 30(8): 25-31.
- LIN W, ZHOU P, ZHOU XB, et al., 2016. Geographic variation in seed traits of different *Zenia insignis* provenances [J]. *J S Chin Agric Univ*, 37(4): 69-74.

- LIU LL, WANG EF, LI JH, 2012. Study on morphological variation in seeds of *Torreya jackii*, an endangered plant in China [J]. *Seed*, 31(1): 31-33.
- LIU XJ, XU DP, YANG ZJ, et al., 2017. Geographic variations in seed germination of *Dalbergia odorifera* T. Chen in response to temperature [J]. *Indust Crop Prod*, 102: 45-50.
- LIU XS, JIANG Y, HUANG RL, et al., 2017. Variation in traits of cone and seed of *Keteleeria fortunei* var. *cyclolepis* and its relationship with environmental factors [J]. *Guihaia*, 37(1): 118-126.
- LONG F, YU CQ, WU CZ, et al., 2016. Phenological characteristics of *Tripterygium wilfordii* Hook. f. of different provenances [J]. *Chin J Appl Environ Biol*, 22(4): 660-666.
- MA YH, JIA RF, YANG ZJ, et al., 2017. Early growth evaluation on six-year-old *Dalbergia odorifera* T. Chen families [J]. *J Centr S Univ For Technol*, 37(8): 42-47.
- MO ZZ, CAO FL, FU YL, et al., 2007. Character variation and principal component analysis of *Ginkgo* cultivar seeds [J]. *J Anhui Agric Sci*, 35(34): 11096-11100.
- NI Z, WANG LH, WU GX, et al., 2008. A review of studies on the introduction and cultivation technology of *Dalbergia odorifera* [J]. *J Fujian For Sci Technol*, 37(4): 197-199.
- NONG Y, LU LH, SUN DJ, et al., 2017. The natural regeneration of karst plantation of *Dalbergia odorifera* [J]. *J Centr S Univer For Technol*, 37(3): 63-68.
- SU HH, WANG H, CHEN ZJ, et al., 2018. The characteristics of species composition, structure and diversity of tropical semi-deciduous forest in Jianfengling, Hainan island [J]. *For Environ Sci*, 34(6): 21-27.
- WANG DW, TANG XM, CHEN XX, et al., 2018. Resource investigation of medicinal plant in Puning city [J]. *Guangdong Chem Ind*, 381(45): 183-185.
- WEI LG, CHEN X, 2017. Growth, biomass accumulation and foliar nutrient status in fragrant rosewood (*Dalbergia odorifera* T.C. Chen) seedlings cultured with conventional and exponential fertilizations under different photoperiod regimes [J]. *Soil Sci Plant Nut*, 63(2): 179-187.
- XIANG T, CUI LX, 2018. A survey of major pest insects and their natural enemies of *Dalbergia odorifera* plantations in Hainan [J]. *Chin J Trop Agric*, 38(11): 59-62.
- YAN PN, LI ZW, LI CR, et al., 2016. The discuss Xiamen botanical garden cactus and succulents special categorized plants gardens planning and design [J]. *Fujian Archit Constr*, 214(04): 40-44.

- YANG F, CHEN RL, LIU JP, et al., 2012. Callus culture and plant regeneration of *Dalbergia odorifera* [J]. *Chin Agric Sci Bull*, 28(13): 70-75.
- YANG XQ, FENG JD, WEI JH, et al., 2007. Genetic diversity of China's endangered medicinal plant *Dalbergia odorifera* [J]. *World Sci Technol Modern Trad Chin Med Mat Med*, 19(2): 73-76.
- YANG XX, LENG PS, ZHENG J, et al., 2016. Variation of phenotypic traits of seed and seedling of *Syringa reticulata* subsp. *amurensis* from different provenances and their correlations with geographic-climatic factors [J]. *J Plant Resour Environ*, 25(3): 80-89.
- YANG ZD, ZHAO YY, YU ZS, et al., 2014. The variations of physiological and root morphological characteristics of *Dalbergia odorifera* seedlings under drought stress [J]. *J For Eng*, 28(3): 63-66.
- YANG ZL, YANG X, TAN ZF, et al., 2010. Variation in phenotypic characteristics and difference in phenological phases of different wild populations of *Lycoris radiata* [J]. *Chin J Appl Environ Biol*, 16(3): 369-375.
- YAN ZQ, 2015. Current situation and countermeasure of underforest economic development in Xianyou county, Fujian province [J]. *Anhui Agric Sci Bull*, 21(20): 81-82, 103.
- YAO QD, LIN QJ, ZHENG ZL, 2013. Study on *Dalbergia odorifera* suitable introduction regions in Fujian province [J]. *J Fujian For Sci Technol*, 39(2): 90-94.
- YU D, BI QX, ZHAO Y, et al., 2019. Geographic variation and excellent provenance selection in *Xanthoceras sorbifolium* [J]. *J NE For Univ*, 47(2): 12-16.
- YU JM, LI FS, LIU XL, et al., 2010. Effects of plant growth regulators on seed germination and seedling growth of *Dalbergia odorifera* [J]. *J Southern Agric*, 41(7): 649-652.
- ZHANG BY, GE YZ, WEI YJ, et al., 2018. Comparative study on cold resistance of seedling leaf of *Dalbergia odorifera* seeds from different places [J]. *SW Chin J Agric Sci*, 31(10): 2098-2103.
- ZHANG Y, LIU C, SHONG A, et al., 2016. Relationship between soil physico-chemical properties and soil enzyme activities in Huixian karst wetland system based on canonical correspondence analysis [J]. *Carsol Sin*, 35(1): 11-18.
- ZHOU XG, LI JY, ZHU HG, et al., 2017. Afforestation preserving rate and young plantation growth of different combating rock desertification models [J]. *Guangxi Sci*, 24(2): 175-181.

Note: Figure translations are in progress. See original paper for figures.

Source: ChinaXiv – Machine translation. Verify with original.